Good governance, PVS evaluation of Veterinary Services and Gap Analysis

Workshop for OIE National Focal Points for Wildlife
Lyon, France, 4-6 November 2009

Dr Mara Gonzalez
Deputy Head, OIE Regional Activities Department

OIE MANDATE

Historical: ‘To prevent animal diseases from spreading around the world’

The 4th Strategic Plan 2006/2010 extends the OIE’s global mandate to:

‘The improvement of animal health all around the world’
OIE OBJECTIVES

ANIMAL HEALTH INFORMATION

to ensure transparency in the global animal disease and zoonosis situation

to collect, analyse and disseminate scientific veterinary information

OIE OBJECTIVES

INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS

to promulgate health standards for the safety of international trade in animals and animal products (within its WTO mandate) and animal disease surveillance

to contribute to food safety and food security and to promote animal welfare, through a science-based approach
OIE OBJECTIVES

ACTIVITIES OF VETERINARY SERVICES

- to provide expertise and encourage international solidarity in the control of animal diseases
- to improve governance and the legal framework and resources of national Veterinary Services

PVS process linked with these objectives

Good Governance
Veterinary Services
Are in the front line to implement OIE objectives

poverty alleviation
food security
market access
food safety
protecting animal health
protecting public health
protecting animal welfare

are a global public good

GOOD VETERINARY GOVERNANCE

• The Global Public Good concept
• The One World One Health (OWOH) concept
• The Good governance concept
• The PVS - Achievements
• The lessons learned from avian influenza crisis
• The way forward
TRENDS in GLOBAL POPULATIONS


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Billions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: US Bureau of the Census

Last year, over 21 billion food animals were produced to help feed a population of over 6 billion people.

Projections toward 2020 indicate that the demand for animal protein will increase by 50%, especially in developing countries.

Source: Center for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) Atlanta
Abundant and safe high quality food always begins with healthy animals

Animal health is a key component of animal welfare

ANIMAL HEALTH IS a KEY COMPONENT of FOOD SECURITY and FOOD SAFETY

- 1 billion poor farmers survive thank to livestock
- Impact of animal diseases on animal production worldwide exceed 20%
- Strong links between animal health, food security and public health
- Animal proteins are crucial for humans
- Global intensification of animal production
Global public goods are goods whose benefits extend to all countries, people and generations.

- In the case of control and eradication of infectious diseases, the benefits are international and inter-generational in scope.
- Countries depend on each other
- Inadequate action by a single country can jeopardize others
- Failure of one country may endanger the planet.
THE GLOBAL PUBLIC GOOD CONCEPT

Animal health systems are a Global Public Good

The CONCEPT of “ONE WORLD-ONE HEALTH” (OWOH)

A global strategy for preventing and managing risks at the human-animal interface
INTERNATIONAL ENGAGEMENT
on the CONCEPT of OWOH

Global partners:
- FAO
- WHO
- OIE
- UNICEF
- World Bank
- UNSIC

Main benefits linked with improvement of animal health systems

Control of animal diseases contributes to:

- **Food Security**
- **Public Health**: zoonoses, food safety
- **Market Access**: local, regional and international
- **Poverty Alleviation**
  - Securing assets (animal capital)
  - Increasing productivity and food production
- **Animal welfare**
There is no where in the world from which we are remote and no one from whom we are disconnected.

Nowadays pathogens are transported around the world faster than the average incubation time of most epizootics.
Annual Global Trade in Exotic Animals

- 4 million birds
- 640,000 reptiles
- 40,000 primates
- Illegal trade unknown – estimate $4-6 billion
The concept of exotic diseases will disappear

Zoonotic potential of animal pathogens

- 60% of human pathogens are zoonotic
- 75% of emerging diseases are zoonotic
- 80% of agents having a potential bioterrorist use are zoonotic pathogens
The CONCEPT of GOOD GOVERNANCE of VETERINARY SERVICES

Requirements for all countries
Need for appropriate legislation and implementation through national animal health systems providing for:

- Appropriate surveillance, early detection, Transparency, Notification
- Rapid response to animal disease outbreaks
- Biosecurity
- Compensation
- Vaccination when appropriate

GOOD GOVERNANCE of VETERINARY SERVICES

Key elements:

- Building and maintaining efficient epidemiosurveillance networks and territorial meshing in the entire national territory,
- A responsibility of Governments
- Alliances between public and private sectors
- Concept and standards of ‘Quality of Services’ adopted by all OIE Members
- If needed, use of the global OIE evaluation and gap analysis tool (PVS)
- Initial and continuous training
OIE World Animal Health and Welfare Fund (World Fund)

• Created in 2004 (Resolution XVII of the OIE International Committee)

« For the purpose of projects of international public utility related to the control of animal diseases, including those affecting humans and the promotion of animal welfare and animal production food safety »

• Good governance of animal health mechanisms
Legal Basis (OIE Code)

from Article 3.2.1.

The purpose of evaluation may be

– to assist a national authority in the decision-making process regarding priorities for its own VS (self-evaluation)…

– to assist the process of risk analysis in international trade … to which official sanitary and/or zoosanitary controls apply.
Legal Basis (OIE Code)

from Article 3.1.3.

“Members should recognise the right of another Member to undertake, or request it to undertake, an evaluation of its VS where the initiating Member is an actual or prospective importer or exporter of commodities, and where the evaluation is to be a component of a risk analysis process which is to be used to determine sanitary measures to be applied to trade.”

OIE Code: Reference to OIE PVS-Tool:

from Article 3.1.5.

• Independent evaluation facilitated by OIE experts under the auspices of the OIE
• …procedures for the evaluation of VS upon request by Members,
• International Committee endorses a list of approved experts…,
• Experts facilitate the evaluation of VS of Members based on the provisions in Chapter 3.2., using the OIE Tool for the Evaluation of Performance of Veterinary Services (OIE PVS Tool).
The OIE-PVS Tool

Evaluation of the Performance of Veterinary Services

a tool for Good Governance of Veterinary Services

Objective: 120 Countries

This global tool provided by the OIE will have a great impact on the promotion and improvement of Veterinary Services worldwide.

OIE PVS TOOL: structure

4 fundamental components

PVS

Critical competencies (6 - 12)

5 levels of advancement
OIE PVS TOOL

4 FUNDAMENTAL COMPONENTS

✓ Human, physical and financial resources
✓ Technical authority and capability
✓ Interaction with stakeholders
✓ Access to markets

6 - 12 critical competencies in each fundamental component
40 critical competencies (37 + 3 split)

I) Human, physical and financial resources
✓ Professional and technical staffing
✓ Competencies of veterinarians and veterinary para-professionals
✓ Physical resources
✓ Funding
✓ …..
OIE PVS TOOL
Critical Competencies: Levels of Advancement

✓ 5 levels of advancement (qualitative) for each critical competency

✓ A higher level assumes compliance with all preceding levels

Level 1
no compliance

Level 5
full compliance with OIE standards

Example

Critical competency II-1
Veterinary Laboratory Diagnosis

Definition:
‘The authority and capability of the VS to identify and record pathogenic agents, including those relevant for public health, that can adversely affect animals and animal products’.
Veterinary Laboratory Diagnosis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Disease diagnosis is almost always conducted by clinical means only, with laboratory diagnostic capability being generally unavailable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>For major zoonoses and diseases of national economic importance, the VS have access to and use a laboratory to obtain a correct diagnosis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>For other zoonoses and diseases present in the country, the VS have access to and use a laboratory to obtain a correct diagnosis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>For diseases of zoonotic or economic importance not present in the country, but known to exist in the region and/or that could enter the country, the VS have access to and use a laboratory to obtain a correct diagnosis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>In the case of new and emerging diseases in the region or world, the VS have access to and use a network of national or international reference laboratories (e.g. an OIE Reference Laboratory) to obtain a correct diagnosis.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Terrestrial Code References:
Point 8 of Article 3.1.2. on Fundamental principles of quality: Procedures and standards.
Point 3 of Article 3.2.6. on Evaluation criteria for material resources: Technical.
Point 5 of Article 3.2.14. on Laboratory services.

OIE PVS APPROACH

- External independent evaluation (objectivity)
  - Experts trained and certified by the OIE
  - Based on facts & evidence, not impressions
- Upon request of the country (voluntary basis)
- To assess:
  - Compliance with OIE Standards
  - Strengths / Weaknesses
  - Gaps / areas for improvement
- Recognised by international donors
  - Prerequisite and key guide for investment requests
- Not an audit
- Country property (confidentiality of results)
STEPS IN THE OIE-PVS EVALUATION

- Official request from the OIE Delegate
- OIE proposes team of experts and dates
- Preparation of the mission (*documents and tentative programme*)
- EVALUATION mission (2 – 3 weeks)
- Draft Report
- Peer review
- Country agreement/comments on PVS report
- Final report confidential until this stage
- ...for release only if agreed

OIE-PVS Evaluation Team

- Team Leader + Expert(s)
  ...+ Observer(s) ...+ Facilitator(s)
- ~150 OIE certified PVS experts trained so far
  (May 06; July 06; Feb. 07 and in Feb. 08)
  (adopted by OIE Members and recognised by donors)
- Five operating languages: English, French, Spanish, Russian and Arabic
- Geographical balance
- Missions financed through the OIE World Fund
OIE-PVS Evaluation: An evolving process

Forum for discussions and analysis:
✓ OIE-PVS internal Task Force
✓ OIE Ad Hoc Group on Evaluation of VS
✓ OIE specific workshops (feed back experts)

Useful elements:
✓ OIE-PVS Tool
✓ Indicators for each CC
✓ OIE-PVS Manual of the Assessor:
  - Vol 1: Guidelines for conducting an evaluation
  - Vol 2: Guidelines for writing a PVS evaluation report

GAP ANALYSIS
GAP ANALYSIS

“Gap Analysis of PVS Outcomes: Evaluation of Needs and Priorities”

Using OIE-PVS Evaluation results...

OIE-PVS Evaluation = “1st Diagnostic” (qualitative):

✓ Compliance with OIE Standards
✓ Strengths / Weaknesses
✓ Gaps / areas for improvement

Next step of the process, “Proposed Treatment” (quantitative):

Gap Analysis:
Evaluation of Needs and Priorities
(quantitative assessment of corresponding needs)

✓ Preparation of strengthening investment programmes
Gap Analysis of PVS Outcomes: Evaluation of Needs and Priorities

✔ PVS Gap Analysis: baseline for the investment programs
✔ Investment programmes: prepared in collaboration with OIE partners (FAO) and donors
  Need of additional expertise: economists, project managers, etc.
✔ Deep involvement of countries concerned: priority setting process (national factors and conditions)
  Focus on specific FC or CC
  Shifting from level “x” to “x +1” or to “x + 2”....

---

Gap Analysis of PVS Outcomes: Evaluation of Needs and Priorities

✔ To identify specific activities, tasks and resources required to address “gaps” (from PVS evaluation)

✔ To determine priorities (country involvement)

✔ Estimation of costs (collaboration from partners and donors)

✔ Preparation of investment programmes (involvement of country and, if needed, commitment from donors)
**Gap Analysis Missions**

- Upon request of countries
- Team composed by OIE-PVS Experts + partners + donors + local team
- Desk review of PVS report to identify specific activities, tasks and resources required to address “gaps” (from PVS evaluation)
- Gap Analysis template (based on PVS structure)
- GA Manual (to be developed with partners/donors)
- Training on GA of PVS experts and others

**After OIE-PVS evaluations: Next steps**

- Continuous missions (each 1-2 years)
- Upon request of countries
- OIE-PVS Experts
- Monitoring and improvement process
- Assessment of progressive evolution of steps taken
- Final objective: compliance with OIE standards
OIE Complementary Assistance

- Animal Health and Veterinary Public Health Legislation generic model (specific missions)
- Laboratory twinning process
- OIE Vaccine Bank support (AI, next FMD, Rabies, other HPED for some regions)
- Regional training programmes for OIE Delegates and focal points
- National seminars on request
- Cost/Benefits studies on Veterinary Services (Prevention cheaper than crisis)

PVS Evaluation Missions – (As at 12 October 2009)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REGION</th>
<th>Official requests from countries</th>
<th>Missions completed</th>
<th>Gap analysis requests</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFRICA</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMERICAS</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIA/PACIFIC</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUROPE</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIDDLE EAST</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL*</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AFRICA (43): Algeria, Benin, Burkina Faso, Burundi, Cameroon, Chad, Côte D’Ivoire, Congo (DR), Djibouti, Egypt, Equatorial Guinea, Eritrea, Gabon, Gambia, Ghana, Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, Kenya, Lesotho, Liberia (non OIE member), Libya, Madagascar, Malawi, Mali, Mauritania, Mauritius, Morocco, Mozambique, Namibia, Nigér, Nigeria, Rwanda, Senegal, Sierra Leone, Somalia, Sudan, Swaziland, Tanzania, Togo, Tunisia, Uganda, Zambia and Zimbabwe.

AMERICAS (17): Barbados, Belize, Bolivia, Brazil, Colombia, Costa Rica, Dominican Republic, El Salvador, Guyana, Honduras, Jamaica, Mexico, Nicaragua, Panama, Paraguay, Peru and Uruguay.


EUROPE (32): Albania, Armenia, Azerbaijan, Bulgaria, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Romania, Turkey, Tajikistan, Ukraine and Uzbekistan.

MIDDLE EAST (11): Bahrain, Jordan, Lebanon, Kuwait, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, Palestine (non OIE member), Oman, Syria, United Arab Emirates and Yemen.

* In italics and black: Completed missions
OIE-PVS missions (as at 12 October 2009)

- Official requests
- Missions completed
- Report's confidentiality lifted

Gap Analysis missions (as at 12 October 2009)

- Official requests
- Missions completed
Legislation missions (as at 12 October 2009)

Without Good Governance of Veterinary Services...

- No early detection,
- No rapid response,
- No biosecurity measures,
- No food safety / food security,
- No reliability of export certification

= Global Threats
Thank you for your attention

Organisation mondiale
de la santé animale

World Organisation
for Animal Health

Organización Mundial
de Sanidad Animal